

## The Personal Voice in Justin's *Apologies* and Tatian's *Oration to the Greeks*

Tim Whitmarsh, 'London' 2020

All translations from Minns and Parvis / Whittaker.

1. Oral devices in Justin: προσφώνησιν ('address', Just. *Apol.* 1 1); τί γὰρ δεῖ εἰδόσιν ὑμῖν λέγειν ... ('for why should I say this to you who know full well ...', Just. *Apol.* 1 9.2) etc. In Athenagoras: e.g. ἀναγκαῖον δέ μοι ἀρχομένω ἀπολογεῖσθαι ... δεηθῆναι ὑμῶν ... ἴσους ἡμῖν ἀκροατὰς γενέσθαι ('As I begin my *apologia* I must ask you to be similar listeners as ...', Athenag. *Leg.* 2.6). Contrast: τὴν ἀναγραφὴν συντάσσειν βούλομαι ('I want to compose this text', Tat. *Or. Ad Gr.* 35.1); γράφειν ... ἀρξάμενος ('having begun to write ...', Tat. *Or. Ad Gr.* 35.1); ταῦθ' ὑμῖν ... συνέταξα ('I have composed these things for you', Tat. *Or. Ad Gr.* 42).

2. ἡμεῖς δὲ ὧν νοοῦμεν καὶ πεπιστεύκαμεν ἔχομεν προφήτας μάρτυρας ... Athenag. *Leg.* 7.3 (cf. 16.4: μαρτυρεῖ δὲ τῷ λόγῳ τούτῳ καὶ Πλάτων ..., 17.2. Also 3.2.) μάρτυρας δὲ οὐ τοὺς οἴκοι παραλήψομαι ... Tat. *Or. Ad Gr.* 31.1 (cf. 1.2). Cf. Just. *Apol.* 1 53.2. ὧ ἄνδρες Ἑλληνας Tat. *Or. Ad Gr.* 1.1, 21.2, 25.2, 42.

3. οὐ γὰρ <έν> μελέτη λόγων ἀλλ' ἐπιδείξει καὶ διδασκαλίᾳ ἔργων τὰ ἡμέτερα ... (We are not concerned with the exercise of eloquence but with the performance and teaching of deeds, Athenag. *Leg.* 33.4; cf. 11.4). Opposition of 'sophists' and 'philosophers': Tat. *Or. Ad Gr.* 40.1 (cf. 25.1, 35.1, 35.2).

4. 'Christian apologists participated in a broader culture of persuasion and defense' (Nasrallah, L. 2010. *Christian Responses to Roman Art and Architecture: The Second-Century Church amid the Spaces of Empire*. Cambridge: 30). Cf. e.g. Koltun-Fromm, N. 2008. 'Re-imagining Tatian: The Damaging Effects of Polemical Rhetoric'. *J ECS* 16: 1–30; Crawford, M. R. 2015. 'Reordering the Confusion: Tatian, the Second Sophistic, and the so-called *Diatessaron*'. *ZAC* 19: 209–36.

5. Hesk, J. 2009. 'Thinking with the Rhetoric of Anti-Rhetoric'. In *Deception and Democracy in Classical Athens*. Cambridge: 242–91.

6. οὐκ αἰτῶ τὴν ὕλην ἃ μὴ ἔχει, οὐδὲ παραλιπὼν τὸν θεὸν τὰ στοιχεῖα θεραπεύω... ('I do not ask of matter what it does not have; nor do I neglect God to serve the elements ...', Athenag. *Leg.* 16.4). ἐγὼ μὲν γὰρ καὶ ἀνθρώπους ἀμαθεῖς καὶ σκαιοὺς λέγω τοὺς ὀργῆ καὶ λύπῃ εἰκόντας ('I for my part regard even men who yield to anger and grief as ignorant and foolish ...', Athenag. *Leg.* 21.2).

7. μαρτυρήσει μοι νῦν Ἐλευσίς ... ('Next I call upon Eleusis for my witness ...') ἐπαινῶ σὲ νῦν, ὧ Δάφνη ... ('I commend you now, Daphne ...') ... λεγέτω μοι νῦν ὁ ἐκατηβόλος ... ('let the far-shooter now tell me ...', Tat. *Or. Ad Gr.* 8.4).

8. γελοῖον ἦν δὴ πρᾶγμα ('The thing would be ridiculous', Just. *Apol.* 1 39.5; cf. 64.9); ψευδολογουμένων ταῦτα καὶ τοῦ περιβλήματος κατεγέλασα ('I laughed at those making false accusations and at their cloak ...', Just. *Apol.* 2 13.1); γελάσαιμι δ' ἂν καὶ τοὺς μέχρι νῦν τοῖς δόγμασιν αὐτοῦ καταχρωμένους ('His [the ancient philosopher's] modern disciples too

are good for a laugh', Tat. *Or. Ad Gr.* 2.2); γελῶ καὶ τὴν Φερεκύδους γρασολογίαν ... ('I have no more respect for Pherecydes' old wives' tales ...', Tat. *Or. Ad Gr.* 3.2); τίς δὲ οὐ γελῶτον εἶναι δόξει ... ('Is it not utterly ridiculous that ...', Tat. *Or. Ad Gr.* 9.3); τίς δὲ οὐκ ἂν γελάσειεν Ἀμαζόνες ... ('Who would not laugh at you, claiming that the Amazons ...', Tat. *Or. Ad Gr.* 32.2); γελῶ καὶ τὴν Μίκωνος ἐπιστήμην ('And I ridicule the skill of Mico ...', Tat. *Or. Ad Gr.* 33.4).

9. Κάγῳ οὖν προσδοκῶ ὑπὸ τινος τῶν ὀνομασμένων ἐπιβουλευθῆναι καὶ ξύλῳ ἐμπαγῆναι, ἢ καὶ ὑπὸ Κρίσκεντος τοῦ φιλοσόφου καὶ φιλοκόμπου. (2) οὐ γὰρ φιλόσοφον εἰπεῖν ἄξιον τὸν ἄνδρα, ὅς γε περὶ ὧν μὴ ἐπίσταται δημοσία καταμαρτυρεῖ, ὡς ἀθέων καὶ ἀσεβῶν Χριστιανῶν ὄντων, πρὸς χάριν καὶ ἡδονὴν τῶν πολλῶν τῶν πεπλανημένων ταῦτα πράττων. ... (4) Καὶ γὰρ προταθέντα με καὶ ἐρωτήσαντα αὐτὸν ἐρωτήσεις τινὰς τοιαύτας καὶ μαθεῖν καὶ ἐλέγξει ὅτι ἀληθῶς μηδὲν ἐπίσταται, εἰδέναι ὑμᾶς βούλομαι. (5) καὶ ὅτι ἀληθῆ λέγω, εἰ μὴ ἀνηνέχθησαν ὑμῖν αἱ κοινωναὶ τῶν λόγων, ἔτοιμος καὶ ἐφ' ὑμῶν κοινωνεῖν τῶν ἐρωτήσεων πάλιν· βασιλικὸν δ' ἂν καὶ τοῦτο ἔργον εἴη. (6) εἰ δὲ καὶ ἐγνώσθησαν ὑμῖν αἱ ἐρωτήσεις μου καὶ αἱ ἐκείνου ἀποκρίσεις, φανερόν ὑμῖν ἐστὶν ὅτι οὐδὲν ἐπίσταται. ἢ εἰ καὶ ἐπίσταται, διὰ τοὺς ἀκούοντας δὲ οὐ τολμᾷ λέγειν, ὡς προέφη, οὐ φιλόσοφος ἀλλὰ φιλόδοξος ἀνὴρ δεικνύεται, ὅς γε μηδὲ τὸ Σωκρατικὸν ἀξιέραστον ὄν τιμᾷ· Ἄλλ' οὕτως γε πρὸ τῆς ἀληθείας τιμητέος ἀνὴρ. (7) ἀδύνατον δὲ Κυρικῶ ἀδιαφορίαν τὸ τέλος προεμένῳ τὸ ἀγαθὸν εἰδέναι πλὴν ἀδιαφορίας.

And so I expect that I will be plotted against and fixed to wood by one of those mentioned, or at least by Crescens, that lover of empty noise and of empty praise. For it would not be right to call the man a lover of wisdom since, to gratify and please the erring multitude he publicly testifies about things of which he knows nothing, namely that the Christians are godless and impious ... For I would have you know that when I had been asked to solve questions put to me I in turn asked him certain questions and so discovered and demonstrated that in truth he knows nothing. And to show that I speak the truth, in the even that these exchanges have not been reported back to you, I am prepared to exchange questions with him again, even in your presence. This too would be a kingly task. But if my questions and his answers were made known to you, then it will be clear that he knows nothing. Or, if he does know but dares not speak for fear of those who would hear, the man is, as I have already said, proved to be a lover not of wisdom but of vainglory who does not honour even the saying of Socrates — which should be held dear: 'But a man is in no way to be honoured in preference to the truth.' (Just. *Apol.* 2 3 [= 8 Minns/Parvis]).

10. Κρίσκης γοῦν ὁ ἐννεοπτεύσας τῇ μεγάλῃ πόλει παιδεραστία μὲν πάντας ὑπερήνεγκεν, φιλαργυρία δὲ πάνυ προσεχῆς ἦν. θανάτου δὲ ὁ καταφρονῶν οὕτως αὐτὸς ἐδεδῖει τὸν θάνατον ὡς καὶ Ἰουστίνον καθάπερ καὶ ἐμὲ ὡς κακῶ τῷ θανάτῳ περιβαλεῖν πραγματεύεσθαι, διότι κηρύττων τὴν ἀλήθειαν λίχνους καὶ ἀπατεῶνας τοὺς φιλοσόφους συνήλεγχεν.

Crescens at any rate who 'nested' in the great city surpassed all others in his passion for boys and was much addicted to avarice. He who advised contempt of death was so afraid of death that he set about involving Justin — as he did me too — in the death penalty as if it were an evil, because in preaching the truth he used to convict philosophers of being gluttons and cheats.

(Tat. Or. Ad Gr. 19.1)

καὶ ἐμὲ ὡς M signo adnotationis in mg. posito : καὶ ἐμὲ οὐς P : καὶ ἐμὲ οἶον : μεγάλω  
Eusebius HE 4.16.9

11. ἔθος δ' αὐτοῖς ἐστὶ μηδένα τῶν ὑποτεταγμένων **θανάτῳ περιβάλλειν** μηδ' ἂν  
καταδικασθεὶς ἐπὶ θανάτῳ τις φανῆ τιμωρίας ἄξιος ...

It is also a custom of theirs that the king shall put no one of his subjects to death, not even if  
a man shall have been condemned to death and is considered deserving of punishment ...  
(Diod. Sic. 3.5.2)

12. *Acts of Justin and Companions*: Musurillo, *Acts of the Christian Martyrs* pp. 43–61. 'Even  
if the dearth of evidence binds the historian's hands, it is necessary to consider the  
possibility that the majority of extant martyr acts date from the Decian period and beyond.  
These revised dates demonstrate that the work performed by ideologies of martyrdom is  
not yoked to any historically verifiable persecution.' (Moss, C. R. 2012. *Ancient Christian  
Martyrdom: Diverse Practices, Theologies, and Traditions*. New Haven: 166).

13. Καὶ γὰρ αὐτὸς ἐγώ, τοῖς Πλάτωνος χαίρων διδάγμασι, διαβαλλομένους ἀκούων  
Χριστιανούς ὁρῶν δὲ ἀφόβους πρὸς θάνατον καὶ πάντα τὰ ἄλλα νομιζόμενα φοβερά,  
ἐνενόουν ἀδύνατον εἶναι ἐν κακίᾳ καὶ φιληδονίᾳ ὑπάρχειν αὐτούς.

For when I myself took delight in the teachings of Plato I heard the Christians slandered and  
saw that they were fearless in the face of death and everything else thought fearful, and  
knew that it was impossible that they were involved in evil and the love of pleasure.  
(Just. Apol. 2 12.1)

14. ὁ πάντων δὲ αὐτῶν εὐτονώτερος πρὸς τοῦτο γενόμενος Σωκράτης τὰ αὐτὰ ἡμῖν  
ἐνεκλήθη, καὶ γὰρ ἔφασαν αὐτὸν καινὰ δαιμόνια εἰσφέρειν καὶ οὐς ἢ πόλις νομίζει θεοὺς  
μὴ ἡγεῖσθαι αὐτόν. (6) ὁ δὲ δαίμονας μὲν τοὺς φαύλους καὶ τοὺς πράξαντας ἃ ἔφασαν οἱ  
ποιηταί, ἐκβαλὼν τῆς πολιτείας καὶ Ὅμηρον καὶ τοὺς ἄλλους ποιητάς, παραιτεῖσθαι τοὺς  
ἀνθρώπους ἐδίδαξε, πρὸς θεοῦ δὲ τοῦ ἀγνώστου αὐτοῖς διὰ λόγου ζητήσεως ἐπίγνωσιν  
προϋτρέπετο ...

But Socrates, who was in this regard the most vigorous of them all was accused of the same  
things as we are, for they said of him also that he brought in new divinities, and that those  
whom the city recognised as gods he did not. But he, throwing Homer and the other poets  
out of the city, taught men to shun demons and those who did what the poets said, and  
urged them to knowledge, through rational enquiry, of the god who was unknown to them  
... (Just. Apol. 2 10.5–6)

15. Σωκράτει μὲν γὰρ οὐδεὶς ἐπέισθη ὑπὲρ τούτου τοῦ δόγματος ἀποθνήσκειν, Χριστῶ δὲ  
τῶ καὶ ὑπὸ Σωκράτους ἀπὸ μέρους γνωσθέντι—λόγος γὰρ ἦν καὶ ἔστιν, ὁ ἐν παντὶ ὦν καὶ  
διὰ τῶν προφητῶν προειπὼν τὰ μέλλοντα γίνεσθαι καὶ δι' ἑαυτοῦ, ὁμοιοπαθοῦς  
γενομένου καὶ διδάξαντος ταῦτα—οὐ φιλόσοφοι οὐδὲ φιλόλογοι μόνον ἐπέισθησαν, ἀλλὰ

καὶ χειροτέχνη καὶ παντελῶς ἰδιῶται, καὶ δόξης καὶ φόβου καὶ θανάτου καταφρονήσαντες, ἐπειδὴ δύναμις ἐστὶ τοῦ ἀρρήτου πατρὸς καὶ οὐχὶ ἀνθρωπείου λόγου κατασκευή.

Now while Socrates persuaded no one to die for this teaching, Christ, since he is the power of the inexpressible father and not the construct of human reason, did persuade not only philosophers and dialecticians but craftsmen and those altogether unskilled, who came to despise honour and fear and death. This was the Christ who was also known in part by Socrates, for he was and is the Logos which is in everything and he foretold through the prophets things that were going to happen, and when he became a sharer in our experiences he taught all this himself. (Just. *Apol.* 2 10.8)

16. Διὰ τί γάρ, ἄνδρες Ἕλληνες, ὥσπερ ἐν πυγμῇ συγκρούειν βούλεσθε τὰς πολιτείας καθ' ἡμῶν; καὶ εἰ μὴ τοῖς τινῶν νομίμοις συγχρησθαι βούλομαι, τίνος χάριν καθάπερ μιαιώτατος μεμίσημαι; προστάττει φόρους τελεῖν ὁ βασιλεύς, ἕτοιμος παρέχειν. δουλεύειν ὁ δεσπότης καὶ ὑπηρετεῖν, τὴν δουλείαν γινώσκω. τὸν μὲν γὰρ ἄνθρωπον ἀνθρωπίνως τιμητέον, φοβητέον δὲ μόνον τὸν θεόν, ὅστις ἀνθρωπίνους οὐκ ἔστιν ὁρατὸς ὀφθαλμοῖς, οὐ τέχνη περιληπτὸς. τοῦτον μόνον ἀρνεῖσθαι κελευόμενος οὐ πεισθήσομαι, τεθνήξομαι δὲ μᾶλλον, ἵνα μὴ ψεύστης καὶ ἀχάριστος ἀποδειχθῶ.

Why, men of Greece, do you want to cause society to come to blows with us? If I refuse to take part in some people's normal activities, why should I be hated as if I were utterly loathsome? The emperor orders me to pay taxes; I am ready to pay. The nobleman orders me to serve and do service; I acknowledge my obligation. Man is entitled to the honour to the degree appropriate for humanity, but only god is to be feared; he is not visible to human eyes nor in any way to be comprehended. Only if I am ordered to deny him will I disobey; I would rather be dead than shown up as an ungrateful liar. (Tat. *Or. Ad Gr.* 4.1)

17. Ταῦτα μὲν οὖν οὐ παρ' ἄλλου μαθὼν ἐξεθέμην, πολλὴν δὲ ἐπιφοιτήσας γῆν καὶ τοῦτο μὲν σοφιστεύσας τὰ ὑμέτερα, τοῦτο δὲ τέχναις καὶ ἐπινοίαις ἐγκυρήσας πολλαῖς, ἔσχατον δὲ τῆ Ῥωμαίων ἐνδιατρίψας πόλει καὶ τὰς ἀφ' ὑμῶν ὡς αὐτοὺς ἀνακομισθείσας ἀνδριάντων ποικιλίας καταμαθὼν. οὐ γάρ, ὡς ἔθος ἐστὶ τοῖς πολλοῖς, ἀλλοτρίαις δόξαις τάμαυτοῦ κρατύνειν πειρῶμαι, πάντων δὲ ὧν <ἄν> αὐτὸς ποιήσωμαι τὴν κατάληψιν, τούτων καὶ τὴν ἀναγραφὴν συντάσσειν βούλομαι. διόπερ χαίρειν εἰπὼν καὶ τῆ Ῥωμαίων μεγαλαυχία καὶ τῆ Ἀθηναίων ψυχρολογία \*\*\* δόγμασιν ἀσυναρτήτοις, τῆς καθ' ἡμᾶς βαρβάρου φιλοσοφίας ἀντεποιησάμην· ἥτις ὄν τρόπον ἐστὶ τῶν παρ' ὑμῖν ἐπιτηδευμάτων ἀρχαιοτέρα, γράφειν μὲν ἀρξάμενος, διὰ δὲ (2) τὸ κατεπεῖγον τῆς ἐξηγήσεως ὑπερθέμενος, νῦν ὅτε καιρὸς περὶ τῶν κατ' αὐτὴν δογμάτων λέγειν, \*\*\* πειράσομαι. μὴ γὰρ δυσχεράνητε τὴν ἡμετέραν παιδείαν μηδὲ φλυαρίας καὶ βωμολοχίας μεστὴν ἀντιλογίαν καθ' ἡμῶν πραγματεύσησθε λέγοντες· Τατιανὸς ὑπὲρ τοῦς Ἕλληνας ὑπὲρ <τε> τὸ ἄπειρον τῶν φιλοσοφησάντων πλῆθος καινοτομεῖ τὰ βαρβάρων δόγματα.

All this I set down not from second-hand knowledge but after much travel. I followed your studies and came across many devices and many notions, and finally I spent time in the city of the Romans and got to know the varieties of statues which they brought home with them from you. For I do not try, as is the habit of most men, to strengthen my case with other men's opinions; I want to compose an account of everything that I personally came to know. So having taken my leave of Roman arrogance and Athenian cold cleverness — incoherent

bases of doctrine — I sought out the philosophy which you consider barbarous. I began to describe the way in which this antedates your practices, but put it off because of the demands of my exposition. Now that I have time, I will try to speak about its doctrines. Do not get impatient with our culture and involve yourselves in fatuous and scurrilous controversy against us, saying “Tatian is going one better than the Greeks and the countless hordes of philosophers with his new-fangled barbarian doctrines!” (Tat. *Or. Ad Gr.* 35.1–2)

18. Cf. Pl. *Ap.* 21e–22e (δεῖ δὴ ὑμῖν τὴν ἐμὴν πλάνην ἐπιδειῖξαι, 22a). 23a: So as a result of this scrutiny, men of Athens, I incurred a great deal of enmity of a very harsh and grievous kind, so that from this there have arisen many slanders (Ἐκ ταυτησὶ δὴ τῆς ἐξετάσεως, ὧ ἄνδρες Ἀθηναῖοι, πολλαὶ μὲν ἀπέχθειαί μοι γεγονάσι καὶ οἷαι χαλεπώταται καὶ βαρύταται, ὥστε πολλὰς διαβολὰς ἀπ’ αὐτῶν γεγονέναι).

19. Ταῦθ’ ὑμῖν, ὧ ἄνδρες Ἕλληνας, ὁ κατὰ βαρβάρους φιλοσοφῶν Τατιανὸς συνέταξα, γεννηθεὶς μὲν ἐν τῇ τῶν Ἀσσυρίων γῆ, παιδευθεὶς δὲ πρῶτον μὲν τὰ ὑμέτερα, δεύτερον δὲ ἄτινα νῦν κηρύττειν ἐπαγγέλλομαι. γινώσκων δὲ λοιπὸν τίς ὁ θεὸς καὶ τίς ἡ κατ’ αὐτὸν ποίησις, ἔτοιμον ἑμαυτὸν ὑμῖν πρὸς τὴν ἀνάκρισιν τῶν δογμάτων παρίστημι μενούσης μοι τῆς κατὰ θεὸν πολιτείας ἀνεξαρνήτου.

All this, men of Greece, I have compiled for you — I, Tatian, a philosopher among the barbarians, born in the land of the Assyrians, and educated first in your learning and secondly in what I profess to preach. Well then, knowing who god is and what is his creation I offer myself to you, prepared for my doctrines to be examined while holding to my way of life in following god with no possibility of denial. (Tat. *Or. Ad Gr.* 42).

20. Τοιόνδε πέρας ἔσχε τὸ σύνταγμα τῶν περὶ Θεαγένην καὶ Χαρίκλειαν Αἰθιοπικῶν· ὁ συνέταξεν ἀνὴρ Φοῖνιξ Ἐμισσηνός, τῶν ἀφ’ Ἡλίου γένος, Θεοδοσίου παῖς Ἡλιόδωρος.

Such was the end of the composition ‘The Ethiopian Story of Theagenes and Charicleia’, composed by a Phoenician man from Emesa, from the race of the sun, Heliodorus the son of Theodosius. (Heliodoros 10.41.4).